

## HARROGATE BOROUGH COUNCIL

### PLANNING AREA2 DC COMMITTEE – AGENDA ITEM 6: LIST OF PLANS.

**DATE: 8 February 2005**

<b>PLAN:</b> 17	<b>CASE NUMBER:</b> 04/05552/FULMAJ
<b>APPLICATION NO.</b> 6.100.2085.B.FULMAJ	<b>GRID REF: EAST</b> 435226 <b>NORTH</b> 457348
29.10.2004	<b>DATE MADE VALID:</b>
<b>TARGET DATE:</b> 28.01.2005	
<b>WARD:</b>	Knareborough East

**APPLICANT:** Mr J Fisher

**AGENT:** Arrowsmith Associates

**PROPOSAL:** Erection of 3 storey building to form 61 bed nursing home, single storey service building, car parking for 19 cars and associated landscaping works (Revised Scheme).

**LOCATION:** Former Timber Yard Hambleton Grove Knareborough North Yorkshire HG5 0DB

## REPORT

### SITE AND PROPOSAL

This is described as a revised application for a 61 bed nursing home on land at the junction of Stockwell Road and Hambleton Grove. However the submitted drawing are the same as those considered and refused by Committee in November 2003. The applicants agent has submitted a planning appraisal in support of the current application

The site was formerly occupied by a timber yard which has now relocated to Manse Lane, Knareborough.

The site has now been cleared and is currently vacant. There are residential properties on Hambleton Grove to the south and dwellings to the west on Stockwell Road. There are commercial business premises to the east and to the north.

The applicants have amended the plans in respect of detailed design issues. However, such details do not fundamentally change the proposal.

### MAIN ISSUES

1. Land Use - Loss of Employment Land
2. Need for Nursing Home
3. Design

### RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

6.100.2085.FUL - Erecting 6 dwellings and 18 apartments: Withdrawn 07.10.2002.

6.100.2085.A.FUL Erecting 61no. bed nursing home Refused 11.11.2003

## **CONSULTATIONS/NOTIFICATIONS**

**Parish Council**  
Knaresborough

### **Environmental Health**

Advises that the site may be contaminated due to its previous use and advises that the adjoining factory may reduce the amenity which residents of the nursing home may reasonably expect

**Chief Engineer (H and T)**  
Recommends a condition

### **Economic Development Officer**

Considers there is now an even greater need to retain the site for employment use (full comments attached as Appendix 1)

### **Conservation and Design Section**

No comments received

### **Yorkshire Water**

Recommend conditions

### **H.B.C Land Drainage**

No comments

### **NYCC Social Services Directorate**

Reply awaited

## APPLICATION PUBLICITY

**SITE NOTICE EXPIRY:** 10.12.2004

**PRESS NOTICE EXPIRY:** 10.12.2004

## REPRESENTATIONS

**KNARESBOROUGH TOWN COUNCIL** - Have no objection and would wish to make the following points:-

1 Employment we understand that this application will generate about 60 full time equivalent jobs. The previous use had 13.

2 We understand the wages bill into the local economy will be in the region of £1.000.000 and a spend locally for goods and services of about £100.000

3In consultation with Social Services at NYCC this Council notes that in the last four years Harrogate and Knaresborough area has lost 40 residential care places and 113 nursing

care places - a reduction of approximately 15%. In addition there has been a charge to the local rates of £15,000 as a result of bed blocking.

Accordingly this Council requests that the planning authority take these figures into account when considering this application, as it is an employment opportunity with a real need for the Harrogate and Knaresborough area.

**OTHER REPRESENTATIONS** - Three letters of objection have been received. One from a local businesses expressing desire to develop the site for employment use. One from a local business expressing concern about suitability of the site for a nursing home given the proximity of other business activity in the immediate area and one from a local resident expressing concern about the loss of an industrial site.

**VOLUNTARY NEIGHBOUR NOTIFICATION** - None.

#### RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

- PPS1 Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Communities
- PPG3 Planning Policy Guidance 3: Housing
- LPE02 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy E2: Retention of Industrial/Business Land and Premises
- LPCF09 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy CF9: Other New Community Facilities
- LPCFX Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy CFX: Community Facilities Protection
- LPH06 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H6: Housing developments in the main settlements and villages
- LPHD20 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy HD20: Design of New Development and Redevelopment
- LPH13 Harrogate District Local Plan (2001, as altered 2004) Policy H13: Housing Density, Layout and Design

#### ASSESSMENT OF MAIN ISSUES

**1. LAND USE - LOSS OF EMPLOYMENT LAND** - Policy E2 of the Harrogate District Local Plan seeks to protect employment land and the loss of such land will not be permitted unless the continued use would cause unacceptable planning problems or the site is allocated for another purpose or the site is within the town centre and the proposed use would contribute to the centres vitality and viability.

The judgement is balanced and it may be argued that the nursing home would provide employment (up to 60 full time). However, a nursing home is a C3 residential use.

However, there is no reason why the redevelopment for employment use would cause unacceptable planning problems, and there are businesses who have expressed interest in the site. The protection of sites in locations easily accessible for the workforce on foot and by public transport is particularly important. The site is not allocated for any other purposes and there is no evidence to suggest that a nursing home would contribute to the vitality and viability of Knaresborough Town Centre.

Taking into account the very clear advice from the Economic Development Officer it is concluded on this issue that there is direct conflict with Policy E2.

**2. NEED FOR A NURSING HOME** - Policy CF9 allow in exceptional circumstances for the redevelopment of an industrial site for community facilities and this would include a nursing home.

The applicants have supplied information which sets out the applicants case that there are exceptional circumstances. (This information was submitted with the previous application upon which they still rely) They supply evidence on the need for beds due to loss of existing homes which have not been able to be altered to meet current care standards and set out their position in respect of difficulties in finding a suitable site when in competition with open market housing developers.

However, it is difficult to conclude that there are no other sites available to allow the exception in Policy CF9 to override the protection of Policy E2.

**3. DESIGN** - Members reached a conclusion on the last application that the size, design and massing would be detrimental to the amenities of the area.

As the drawing submitted with this application are the same as previously refused the conclusion remains the same and there would be conflict with Policy HD20

**CONCLUSION** - Members should consider the balance between the provision of nursing care and the protection of employment land. Although it is appreciated that the applicants have been looking for a site, part of their difficulty is the competition in terms of open market housing land values. However, it is not considered that there are no sites available and given the expressions of interest in the site for industrial use it is not considered that the exceptional circumstances have demonstrated and therefore Policy E2 should prevail. The scale of development has not changed

Refusal is accordingly recommended.

**CASE OFFICER:** Mr R N Watson

#### RECOMMENDATION

**That the application be REFUSED. Reason(s) for refusal: -**

- 1 The proposed development of the site would result in the loss of an employment site and in the absence of any exceptional circumstances would conflict with Policy E2 of the Harrogate District Local Plan.
- 2 The proposed development by virtue of its size, design and massing would be detrimental to the amenities of the area and would conflict with Policy HD20 of the Harrogate District Local Plan.



**Harrogate**  
BOROUGH COUNCIL

This map is a reproduction of Ordnance Survey data with the permission of Ordnance Survey on behalf of the Controller of Her Majesty's Stationery Office. Crown Copyright. Unauthorised reproduction is prohibited. Copyright and may need to be updated or not your edition.  
 Harrogate Borough Council 2004

**Area 2DC Committee**

**08/02/2005**

App No.: 6.100.2085.B.FULMAJ Case No.: 04/05552/FULMAJ  
 Scale: 1:1250 (at A4 size) Item No: 17  
 Drawn by J Brown Site Area: 0.28 hectares

Site 

**Produced for Development Control Area Planning Committee for site identification purposes only.**

